

# FACT CHECK FILE

## BECAUSE FACTS MATTER

### "KILLED AND DISABLED 220,000"

THE STATISTICS FOR THE DEATH TOLL FROM TUBERCULOSIS ARE GIVEN ON PAGE 6 OF "THE CONTROL AND ERADICATION OF TUBERCULOSIS" H. SUTHERLAND, ED. WILLIAM GREEN & SONS, EDINBURGH AND LONDON, 1911, AND IN "CONSUMPTION: ITS CAUSE AND CURE" RED TRIANGLE PRESS 1917.

### "SCIENTISTS THOUGHT THE DISEASE OR A SUSCEPTIBILITY TO IT, WAS CAUSED BY HEREDITY..."

PROFESSOR KARL PEARSON ON APRIL 28, 1910 PEARSON GAVE THE PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS AT THE ANNUAL GENERAL MEETING OF THE SOCIAL AND POLITICAL EDUCATION LEAGUE. HIS TOPIC WAS "NATURE AND NURTURE: THE PROBLEM OF THE FUTURE". IN IT HE SAID THAT: "THE INFLUENCE OF ENVIRONMENT IS NOT ONE-FIFTH OF HEREDITY, AND QUITE POSSIBLY NOT ONE-TENTH OF IT."

### "DOCTORS... THOUGHT THE DISEASE OR A SUSCEPTIBILITY TO IT, WAS CAUSED BY HEREDITY..."

DR JOHN HAYCRAFT "DARWINISM AND RACE PROGRESS" (SWAN SONNENSCHNEIN & CO. NEW YORK 1895) PAGE 55.

"IT IS A HARD SAYING, BUT NONE THE LESS A TRUE ONE THAT THE BACILLUS TUBERCULOSUS IS A FRIEND OF THE RACE, FOR IT ATTACKS NO HEALTHY MAN OR WOMAN BUT ONLY THE FEEBLE"

SIR JAMES BARR'S PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS AT THE 80TH ANNUAL MEETING OF THE BRITISH MEDICAL ASSOCIATION IS SHOWN IN THE BRITISH MEDICAL JOURNAL. 1912 JUL 27; 2(2691): 157-163.

### "...RESTRICTION IN THE MARRIAGE OF UNDESIRABLES"

SIR JAMES BARR'S SPEECH "THE FUTURE OF THE MEDICAL PROFESSION" IS RECORDED IN THE BRITISH MEDICAL JOURNAL. 1918 SEP 21; 2(3012): 318-321. "THE PHYSICALLY AND MENTALLY FIT ARE CARRYING ON THE WAR, WHILE THE DERELICTS ARE CARRYING ON THE RACE. THE LOWEST FOURTH OF THE POPULATION ARE PRODUCING MORE THAN HALF OF THE NEXT GENERATION..."

"SPEAKING OUT AGAINST THE SERVILE STATE" MAKES A NUMBER OF ASSERTIONS. THIS INFOGRAPHIC CITES THE EVIDENCE FOR THE ASSERTIONS MADE SO YOU CAN BE SURE THAT IT IS FOUNDED ON HISTORICAL EVIDENCE.

**IN BRIEF**

## Speaking out against the servile state

*Dr Halliday Sutherland's fight against negative eugenics*

In 1911, Dr. Halliday Sutherland was at the forefront of the fight against tuberculosis (TB), a disease that killed and disabled 220,000 people in Britain each year.

TB was a disease of poverty, affecting the poor around three times more than the wealthy. At the time, doctors and scientists thought the disease (or a susceptibility to it) was caused by heredity, not infection.

### HEREDITARY OR INFECTIVE?

If a disease was hereditary, the only way to prevent it was to ensure that the defective genes were not passed on. As the professor of eugenics at London University, Karl Pearson, put it:

“The bulk of the tuberculous belong to stocks which we want *ab initio* to discourage. Everything which tends to check the multiplication of the unfit, to emphasize that the fertility of the physically and mentally healthy, will pro tanto aid Nature's method of reducing the phthisical death-rate.”

In 1911, Sutherland formed the view that TB was infective, not hereditary. His views, published in the British Medical Journal in 1912, were at odds with the medical establishment.

<b>BARR</b>	<b>SUTHERLAND</b>
	
Sir James Barr, President of the British Medical Association.	Dr Halliday Sutherland, Medical Officer of the St Marylebone Dispensary for the Prevention of Tuberculosis.
“Until we have some restriction in the marriage of undesirables the elimination of the tubercle bacillus is not worth aiming at. It forms a rough, but on the whole very serviceable check, on the survival and propagation of the unfit. If tomorrow the tubercle bacillus were non-existent, it would be nothing short of a national calamity. We are not yet ready for its disappearance.”	“There are some self-styled eugenisists who declaim that the prevention of disease is not in itself a good thing. They say the efficiency of the State is based upon what they call 'the survival of the fittest.' I don't know what they mean. I do know that in preventing disease you are not preserving the weak, but conserving the strong.”

HALLIDAYSUTHERLAND.COM

"BUT WHY SHOULD YOU SET OUT TO PREVENT THIS INFECTION AND TO CURE THE DISEASE? THERE ARE SOME SELF-STYLED EUGENISTS—WHOM YOU, SIR, HAVE CASTIGATED FROM YOUR PULPIT AS RACE BREEDERS WITH THE SOULS OF CATTLE-BREEDERS—WHO DECLAIM THAT THE PREVENTION OF DISEASE IS NOT IN ITSELF A GOOD THING. THEY SAY THE EFFICIENCY OF THE STATE IS BASED UPON WHAT THEY CALL 'THE SURVIVAL OF THE FITTEST.' THIS WAR HAS SMASHED THEIR RHETORICAL PHRASE. WHO TALKS NOW ABOUT SURVIVAL OF THE FITTEST, OR THINKS HIMSELF FIT BECAUSE HE SURVIVES? I DON'T KNOW WHAT THEY MEAN. I DO KNOW THAT IN PREVENTING DISEASE YOU ARE NOT PRESERVING THE WEAK, BUT CONSERVING THE STRONG. AND I DO KNOW THAT THOSE EVIL CONDITIONS WHICH WILL KILL A WEAKLY CHILD WITHIN A FEW MONTHS OF BIRTH, AND SLAY ANOTHER WHEN HE REACHES THE TEENS, WILL DESTROY YET ANOTHER WHEN HE COMES TO ADULT LIFE."

### "AT THE FOREFRONT OF THE FIGHT AGAINST TUBERCULOSIS"

DR SUTHERLAND'S ACTIVITIES INCLUDED: ACTING AS MEDICAL OFFICER OF THE ST MARYLEBONE DISPENSARY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CONSUMPTION. HE ESTABLISHED AN "OPEN AIR SCHOOL" IN A BANDSTAND IN REGENT'S PARK. HE PRODUCED BRITAIN'S FIRST CINEMA PUBLIC HEALTH FILM ("THE STORY OF JOHN M' NEIL") AND HE EDITED AND CONTRIBUTED TO A BOOK ON T.B. BY WORLD EXPERTS.

THE SOURCES OF INFORMATION INCLUDE: HALLIDAY SUTHERLAND OBITUARY IN BRITISH MEDICAL JOURNAL. 1960 APR 30; 1(5182): 1368-1369. BRITISH FILM INSTITUTE COLLECTIONS ([HTTP://WWW.BFI.ORG.UK/FILMS-TV-PEOPLE/4CE289F3506D5](http://www.bfi.org.uk/films-tv-people/4ce289f3506d5))

"THE TIMES" 18TH MAY 1937 CONTAINED AN ARTICLE ON THE ACQUISITION OF THE FILM BY THE B.F.I. THE BOOK WAS "THE CONTROL AND ERADICATION OF TUBERCULOSIS" H. SUTHERLAND, ED. WILLIAM GREEN & SONS, EDINBURGH AND LONDON, 1911.

### "IN 1911 SUTHERLAND FORMED THE VIEW THE TB WAS INFECTIVE..."

SEE SUTHERLAND'S REPORT AS MEDICAL OFFICER IN THE FIRST ANNUAL REPORT OF THE ST MARYLEBONE DISPENSARY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CONSUMPTION 31ST DECEMBER 1911, PAGES 57-8

### "HIS VIEWS, PUBLISHED IN THE BRITISH MEDICAL JOURNAL..."

SEE SUTHERLAND'S ARTICLE "THE SOIL AND THE SEED IN TUBERCULOSIS" BRITISH MEDICAL JOURNAL. 1912 NOV 23; 2(2708): 1434-1437

### "THERE ARE SOME SELF-STYLED EUGENISTS..."

THESE WORDS WERE FROM SUTHERLAND'S SPEECH TO THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF THE Y.M.C.A. ON SEPTEMBER 4TH, 1917. "CONSUMPTION: ITS CAUSE AND CURE" RED TRIANGLE PRESS 1917 PAGE 9.

# FACT CHECK FILE

## BECAUSE FACTS MATTER

"...REDUCTION OF THE BIRTH RATE AT THE WRONG..."

SEE: "THE TRIAL OF MARIE STOPES" EDITED, AND WITH AN INTRODUCTION BY, MURIEL BOX (FEMINA BOOKS 1967). ON PAGE 55 STOPES WAS ASKED BY HER BARRISTER, MR PATRICK HASTINGS, K.C. ABOUT HER WORK:

HASTINGS: "IS THE REDUCTION OF THE BIRTH RATE ANY PART AT ALL OF YOUR CAMPAIGN?"

STOPES: "NOT A REDUCTION OF THE TOTAL BIRTH RATE, BUT A REDUCTION OF THE BIRTH RATE AT THE WRONG PART AND INCREASE OF THE BIRTH RATE AT THE RIGHT END OF THE SOCIAL SCALE."

...AND LATER...

HASTINGS: "WOULD YOU, IN YOUR OWN WORDS, DESCRIBE TO US IN A FEW SHORT SENTENCES WHAT ARE THE OBJECTS AND PURPOSES OF YOUR SOCIETY?"

STOPES: "THE OBJECT OF THE SOCIETY IS, IF POSSIBLE, TO COUNTERACT THE STEADY EVIL WHICH HAS BEEN GROWING FOR A GOOD MANY YEARS OF THE REDUCTION OF THE BIRTH RATE JUST ON THE PART OF THE THRIFTY, WISE, WELL-CONTENTED, AND THE GENERALLY SOUND MEMBERS OF OUR COMMUNITY, AND THE RECKLESS BREEDING FROM THE C.3 END, AND THE SEMI-FEEBLEMINDED, THE CARELESS, WHO ARE PROPORTIONATELY INCREASING IN OUR COMMUNITY BECAUSE OF THE SLOWING OF THE BIRTH RATE AT THE OTHER END OF THE SOCIAL SCALE. STATISTICS SHOW THAT EVERY YEAR THE BIRTH RATE FROM THE WORST END OF OUR COMMUNITY IS INCREASING IN PROPORTION TO THE BIRTH RATE AT THE BETTER END, AND IT WAS IN ORDER TO TRY TO RIGHT THAT GRAVE SOCIAL DANGER THAT I EMBARKED UPON THIS WORK."

NOTE THAT WHEN STOPES GIVE THESE ANSWERS, SHE WAS UNDER OATH IN THE HIGH COURT.

"...STOPES SUED HIM FOR LIBEL..."

SEE: "THE TRIAL OF MARIE STOPES" EDITED, AND WITH AN INTRODUCTION BY, MURIEL BOX (FEMINA BOOKS 1967). THE BOOK IS MISLEADINGLY GIVEN THAT (1) IT WAS A CIVIL TRIAL AND (2) IT WAS STOPES WHO SUED SUTHERLAND (I.E. SHE WAS THE PLAINTIFF AND HE WAS THE DEFENDANT. .

"SPEAKING OUT AGAINST THE SERVILE STATE" MAKES A NUMBER OF ASSERTIONS. THIS INFOGRAPHIC CITES THE EVIDENCE FOR THE ASSERTIONS MADE SO YOU CAN BE SURE THAT IT IS FOUNDED ON HISTORICAL EVIDENCE.

### THE MOTHERS' CLINIC



In 1921, Dr Marie Stopes opened the first birth-control clinic in the British Empire in a poor part of London. There, women could obtain advice on contraception free-of-charge and could purchase contraceptive devices at cost.

She established the *Society for Constructive Birth Control and Racial Progress* to support the clinic. She explained that she undertook her work to achieve a:



"reduction of the birth rate at the wrong part and increase of the birth rate at the right end of the social scale. Statistics show that every year the birth rate from the worst end of our community is increasing in proportion to the birth rate at the better end, and it was in order to try to right that grave social danger that I embarked upon this work."



That same year, Stopes lobbied MPs and the Prime Minister for the compulsory sterilization of people she described as "wastrels, the diseased, the miserable, the criminal" the "degenerate, feeble minded and unbalanced" and "parasites".

### FOR & AGAINST

<h4>BARR</h4>  <p>Stopes' Clinic was the check that Barr had sought, and he congratulated her.</p> <p>"You and your husband have inaugurated a great movement which I hope will eventually get rid of our C3 population and exterminate poverty. The only way to raise an A1 population is to breed them"</p> <p><small>"A1" and "C3" were terms used by army recruitment officers to describe the best and the worst recruits. C3 designated those unfit to serve in the army on the grounds of physical or mental incapacity.</small></p>	<h4>SUTHERLAND</h4>  <p>Stopes' campaign would enslave the poor, and he opposed her in his 1922 book, <i>Birth Control</i>.</p> <p>"If children are to be denied to the poor as a privilege of the rich, then it would be easy to exploit the women of the poorer classes. The English poor have already lost even the meaning of the word 'property,' and if the birth controllers had their way the meaning of the word 'home' would soon follow. This policy on the poor points unmistakably to the servile state."</p> <p>Sutherland faced financial ruin when Stopes sued him for libel over a passage in <i>Birth Control</i>. Barr, by then Vice-President of the <i>Society for Constructive Birth Control and Racial Progress</i>, testified for Stopes in the trial. Sutherland won the case in 1924.</p> <p>HALLIDAYSUTHERLAND.COM</p>
--	--

"...SUTHERLAND FACED FINANCIAL RUIN..."

SEE "A TIME TO KEEP" BY HALLIDAY SUTHERLAND. GEOFFREY BLES. 1934..

HALLIDAYSUTHERLAND.COM

"...OPENED THE FIRST BIRTH CONTROL CLINIC..."

SEE: "PASSIONATE CRUSADER" BY RUTH HALL. HARCOURT BRACE JOVANOVICH NEW YORK AND LONDON 1977 (PAGE 188).

"MARIE STOPES AND THE SEXUAL REVOLUTION" BY JUNE ROSE. FABER AND FABER LONDON AND BOSTON 1993 (PAGE 144 OF THE PAPERBACK EDITION).

"...ESTABLISHED THE SOCIETY..."

SEE: "PASSIONATE CRUSADER" BY RUTH HALL. HARCOURT BRACE JOVANOVICH NEW YORK AND LONDON 1977 (PAGE 199).

"MARIE STOPES AND THE SEXUAL REVOLUTION" BY JUNE ROSE. FABER AND FABER LONDON AND BOSTON 1993 (PAGE 153 OF THE PAPERBACK EDITION).

"...LOBBIED MPS AND THE PRIME MINISTER..."

SEE: "PASSIONATE CRUSADER" BY RUTH HALL. HARCOURT BRACE JOVANOVICH NEW YORK AND LONDON 1977 (PAGES 169 AND 206).

"MARIE STOPES AND THE SEXUAL REVOLUTION" BY JUNE ROSE. FABER AND FABER LONDON AND BOSTON 1993 (PAGE 138 AND PAGES 160-161 OF THE PAPERBACK EDITION).

"...COMPULSORY STERILIZATION OF PEOPLE..."

SEE: CHAPTER 20 "RADIANT MOTHERHOOD: A BOOK FOR THOSE WHO ARE CREATING THE FUTURE." (1920) BY MARIE CARMICHAEL STOPES. G.P. PUTNAM'S SONS LTD, LONDON.

STOPES WAS ALSO ON RECORD ADVOCATING THE COMPULSORY STERILISATION WHILE TAKING PART IN THE NATIONAL BIRTH RATE COMMISSION.

"...IF CHILDREN ARE TO BE DENIED..."

SEE "BIRTH CONTROL" BY DR. HALLIDAY SUTHERLAND. (1922) HARDING & MORE LTD, LONDON. PAGES 102-3.

"...YOU AND YOUR HUSBAND HAVE INAUGURATED..."

SEE "QUEEN'S HALL MEETING ON CONSTRUCTIVE BIRTH CONTROL: SPEECHES AND IMPRESSIONS" G.P. PUTNAM'S SONS LTD, LONDON. 2ND EDITION, APRIL 1923. PAGE 8.

BARR SIGNED OFF THE LETTER: "WITH BEST WISHES FOR THE SUCCESS OF YOUR MOVEMENT".

"...WON THE CASE IN 1924..."

SEE: "THE TRIAL OF MARIE STOPES" EDITED, AND WITH AN INTRODUCTION BY, MURIEL BOX (FEMINA BOOKS 1967).